



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/667,690	09/22/2003	Andrew Doddington	14846-15	9387

7590 12/12/2006

MICHAEL B. JOHANNESSEN, ESQ.  
LOWENSTEIN SANDLER, P.C.  
65 LIVINGSTON AVENUE  
ROSELAND, NJ 07068

EXAMINER

LOVEL, KIMBERLY M

ART UNIT PAPER NUMBER

2167

DATE MAILED: 12/12/2006

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

# Office Action Summary

Application No.

10/667,690

Applicant(s)

DODDINGTON, ANDREW

Examiner

Kimberly Lovel

Art Unit

2167

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

## Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

## Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 15 September 2006.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

## Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-16 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-16 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

## Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☒ The drawing(s) filed on 15 September 2006 is/are: a) ☒ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

## Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some \* c) ☐ None of:
- ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
  - ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
  - ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

## Attachment(s)

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| 1) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)                                | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)<br>Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)                       | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application                       |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)<br>Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____ | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____  |

### **DETAILED ACTION**

1. This communication is responsive to the Amendment filed 15 September 2006.
2. Claims 1-16 are pending in this application. Claims 1 and 11 are independent. Claim 1 has been amended. This action is made Non-Final.
3. The rejections of claims 1-16 as being anticipated by US Patent No 6,615,258 to Barry et al.

### ***Drawings***

4. The objections to the drawings are withdrawn as necessitated by the amendments.

### ***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 101***

5. The rejections of 1-15 are withdrawn as necessitated by amendment.

### ***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102***

6. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(e) the invention was described in (1) an application for patent, published under section 122(b), by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent or (2) a patent granted on an application for patent by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent, except that an international application filed under the treaty defined in section 351(a) shall have the effects for purposes of this subsection of an application filed in the United States only if the international application designated the United States and was published under Article 21(2) of such treaty in the English language.

**7. Claims 1-16 rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by US PGPub 2003/0078960 to Murren et al (hereafter Murren).**

**Referring to claim 1**, Murren discloses a method for presenting data and functions to a user via a presentation layer, for use in a distributed processing system to effect an interface between a business layer and the presentation layer, the method comprising the steps of:

defining a data set structure [constraints] for use in both the business layer and the presentation layer, said data set structure comprising hierarchical organizational information [hierarchy of constraint layers] for data and functions [configuration parameters and application functions] (see [0161], lines 5-9 and [0162]);

populating a business layer data set in said business layer [business layer 204] according to said data set structure, said business layer data set comprising data and functions available for use in said business layer (see [0079]-[0080]); and

populating a presentation layer [presentation layer 212] data set in said presentation layer according to said data set structure from said business layer [business logic layer 204] data set, said presentation layer data set comprising data and functions available for use by the user [output is rendered based on the type of receiving device] in said presentation layer (see [0142]; [0153]-[0158]; and Fig 11).

**Referring to claim 2**, Murren discloses a method in accordance with claim 1 wherein defining a data set structure comprises defining a plurality of items comprising a plurality of data items [configuration parameters] and a plurality of function items [functions of the application] (see [0162], lines 3-7).

**Referring to claim 3**, Murren discloses a method in accordance with claim 2 wherein defining a plurality of data items comprises defining a data value for each of said plurality of data items [setting values in the attribute store] (see [0086]; [0091]; and [0093]).

**Referring to claim 4**, Murren discloses a method in accordance with claim 2 wherein defining a plurality of data items comprises defining a domain [problem domain: e.g., asset lending, asset management, insurance, etc.] for each of said plurality of data items (see [0051]).

**Referring to claim 5**, Murren discloses a method in accordance with claim 4 wherein defining a domain for each of said data items comprises defining a domain home [problem domain] for each of said plurality of data items (see [0051]).

**Referring to claim 6**, Murren discloses a method in accordance with claim 4 wherein defining a domain [asset management domain] for each of said data items comprises defining a context [asset management] for each of said plurality of data items (see [0068]).

**Referring to claim 7**, Murren discloses a method in accordance with claim 4 wherein defining a domain [e.g., asset lending, asset management, insurance, etc.] for each of said data items comprises defining a range domain for each of said plurality of data items (see [0051]).

**Referring to claim 8**, Murren discloses a method in accordance with claim 4 wherein defining a domain for each of said plurality of data items comprises defining a discrete domain for each of said plurality of data items (see [0051]).

Art Unit: 2167

**Referring to claim 9**, Murren discloses a method in accordance with claim 2 wherein defining a plurality of function items comprises defining a function for each of said plurality of function items (see [0162], lines 3-7).

**Referring to claim 10**, Murren discloses a method in accordance with claim 2 wherein defining a plurality of function items comprises defining a function set for each of said plurality of function items (see [0162], lines 3-7).

**Referring to claim 11**, Murren discloses an apparatus for use in a distributed data processing system comprising:

a data set [hierarchy of constraint layers] for storing available data and identification of function calls [configuration parameters and application functions] (see [0161], lines 5-9 and [0162]);

a presentation layer [presentation layer 212] configured to store data and identification of function calls that are available for use by a user in accordance with said data set (see [0142]; [0153]-[0158]; and Fig 11); and

a business layer [business layer 204] configured to store data and identification of function calls that are available for use by said presentation layer in accordance with said data set (see [0079]-[0080]).

**Referring to claim 12**, Murren discloses an apparatus in accordance with claim 11 wherein said presentation layer is further configured to request data and identification of function calls from said business layer and to store said data and identification of function calls in accordance with said data set so that data and

identification of function calls of said business layer can be available to said presentation layer (see [0142]; [0153]-[0158]; and Fig 11).

**Referring to claim 13**, Murren discloses an apparatus in accordance with claim 12 wherein said business layer comprises a plurality of processors wherein each of said processors is configured to store data and identification of function calls that are available for use by said presentation layer in accordance with said data set wherein each of said processors provides unique data and identification of function calls to said presentation layer (see [0079]-[0080]; [0142]; [0153]-[0158]; Fig 11).

**Referring to claim 14**, Murren discloses an apparatus in accordance with claim 13 wherein business layer function calls are available to said presentation layer for execution at said presentation layer via said data set (see [0079]-[0080]; [0142]; [0153]-[0158]; Fig 11).

**Referring to claim 15**, Murren discloses an apparatus in accordance with claim 13 wherein business layer function calls are available to said presentation layer for execution at said business layer via said data set (see [0079]-[0080]; [0142]; [0153]-[0158]; Fig 11).

**Referring to claim 16**, Murren discloses an apparatus in accordance with claim 13 wherein business layer function calls are available at said presentation layer for execution at both said presentation layer and at said business layer via said data set (see [0079]-[0080]; [0142]; [0153]-[0158]; Fig 11).

***Response to Arguments***

8. Applicant's arguments with respect to claims 1-16 have been considered but are moot in view of the new ground(s) of rejection.



### **Conclusion**


Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Kimberly Lovel whose telephone number is (571) 272-2750. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:00 - 4:00.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, John Cottingham can be reached on (571) 272-7079. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

Kimberly Lovel  
Examiner  
Art Unit 2167

7 December 2006  
kml

  
**JOHN COTTINGHAM**  
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER  
TECHNOLOGY CENTER 2100